



Government of Punjab
Punjab Intermediate Cities Improvement Investment
Programme



EVALUATION REPORT

**Loan No. 3562-PAK: Punjab Intermediate Cities Improvement Investment Program (PICIIP)
Asian Development Bank Funded Project**

Engineering Procurement and Construction Management (EPCM) Consultant (PICIIP_Cons2)

- The EOIs for EPCM consultancy services were published on September 15, 2017 on Consultant Selection Recruitment Notice (ADB Website), PPRA website and newspapers (The News, Nawa e Waqt and Daily Dunya) with the deadline of October 30, 2017. 12 EOIs for EPCM were received through CMS web of ADB. 6 firms were shortlisted as per ADB guidelines out of 12.

	Name of the Consultant (Full Name not Acronym)	Country of Incorporation	Type of Association (Lead/JV member or Sub-consultant.)	Type of the legal entity (Private Firm, State-Owned (SOE) or NGO)
1.	(i) M/s Associated Consulting Engineers – ACE (Pvt) Ltd	Pakistan	Lead	Private
	(ii) M/s SMEC International Pty Ltd	Australia	JV member	Private
	(iii) M/s Engineering General Consultants (Pvt) Ltd. EGC	Pakistan	JV member	Private
2.	(i) M/s Saman Corporation (SAMAN)	Republic of Korea	Lead	Private
	(ii) M/s Umar Munshi Associate	Pakistan	JV member	Private
	(iii) M/s Eminence One (SMC-Pvt) Ltd.	Pakistan	Sub-consultant	Private
	(iv) Indus Associated Consultants (Pvt) Ltd	Pakistan	Sub-consultant	Private
3.	(i) M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd (NESPAK)	Pakistan	Lead	Private
	(ii) M/s ARTELIA International	France	JV member	Private
4.	(i) M/s DECON International GmbH	Germany	Lead	Private
	(ii) M/s Rehman Habib Consultants (Pvt) Ltd	Pakistan	Sub-consultant	Private
	(iii) M/s Al Kasib Group of Engineering Services (AGES Con)	Pakistan	JV member	Private
	(iv) M/s Asian Advisory Services	Pakistan	Sub-consultant	Private
	(v) M/s EEC Global (Pvt) Ltd	Pakistan	JV member	Private



Government of Punjab
Punjab Intermediate Cities Improvement Investment
Programme



	Name of the Consultant (Full Name not Acronym)	Country of Incorporation	Type of Association (Lead/JV member or Sub-consultant.)	Type of the legal entity (Private Firm, State-Owned (SOE) or NGO)
	(vi) M/s Enviro Consult (SMC-Pvt) Ltd (EC)	Pakistan	Sub-consultant	Private
	(vii) M/s Multitech Consulting Engineers (MCE)	Pakistan	JV member	Private
5.	(i) M/s Renardet S.A.	Switzerland	Lead	Private
	(ii) M/s Studio Galli Associazione Professionale d'Ingegneria	Italy	JV member	Private
6.	(i) M/s Meinhardt (Singapore) Pte Ltd	Singapore	Lead	Private
	(ii) M/s Meinhardt Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd	Pakistan	Sub-consultant	Private

2. As per ADB Guidelines, for the consultancy packages selection, the selection process adopted was Full Technical Proposal, QCBS (90:10) was approved from Consultant Selection Committee. RFPs were issued to the 6 shortlisted firms on December 30, 2017, out of which 3 firms submitted the proposals according to the RFP and subsequent Addenda 1 and 2 on February 20, 2018. The proposals were technically evaluated and all firms passed the threshold of passing marks. Financial proposals were opened on March 13, 2018. The combined results of technical and financial evaluation is given below;



Government of Punjab
Punjab Intermediate Cities Improvement Investment
Programme



FIRM NAME	TECHNICAL EVALUATION				FINANCIAL EVALUATION			COMBINED	RANKING
	Technic al Score Points	Techni cal Wt. Factor	Technical Points	Evaluated Total Price (US\$)	Financia l Score Points ¹	Price Wt. Factor	Price Points	Total Evaluation Points	
	1	2	3 = 1 x 2	5	6	7	8 = 6 x 7	9 = 3 + 8	
M/s National Engineering Services (Pvt) Ltd. (NESPK) in JV Partner M/s Artelia International	845	0.9	760.50	USD 2,853,098	957	0.1	95.68	856.18	1
M/s SAMAN Corporation in JV Partner (i) M/s Umar Munshi Associate & Sub-Consultant (i) M/s Eminence One (SMC-Pvt) Ltd. (ii) Indus Associated Consultants (Pvt) Ltd	821	0.9	738.90	USD 2,729,744	1000	0.1	100.00	838.90	2
M/s DECON International GmbH in JV Partner (i) M/s Multitech Consulting Engineers (MCE) (ii) M/s EEC Global (Pvt) Ltd (iii) M/s Al Kasib Group of Engineering Services (AGES Con) & Sub-Consultant (i) M/s Rehman Habib Consultants (Pvt) Ltd (ii) M/s Asian Advisory Services (iii) M/s Enviro Consult (SMC-Pvt) Ltd (EC)	776	0.9	698.40	USD 2,985,622	914	0.1	91.43	789.83	3

3. NOC were obtained from ADB for all the evaluation process and the invitation for contract negotiations were sent to the first ranked firm and after successful contract negotiations, the contract is awarded to M/s National Engineering Services (Pvt) Ltd. (NESPK) in JV Partner M/s Artelia International on April 18, 2018.

PD – PICIIP
LG&CD Department